CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 29, 2012 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR

SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:05PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Alex Bethke	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present arrived @ 1:24PM, left at 3:00PM
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present

BoardmemberTom LarimerPresentBoardmemberEvelya RiveraPresentBoardmemberAbel SilvasPresentBoardmemberAnn WoodsPresent

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Cathy Winterrowd, Assistant Deputy Director

Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner Jeff Oakley, Associate Planner Camille Pekarek, Planning Intern Sarah Vonesh, Planning Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR September 27, 2012 and October 25, 2012

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE SEPTEMBER 27, 2012 MINUTES WITH CHANGES

Seconded by Chair Lemmo Vote: 8-0-1 Motion Passes

(Silvas)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 25, 2012 MINUTES AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Chair Lemmo Vote: 8-0-1 Motion Passes

(Rivera)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- ABSENCES
- Boardmember Bethke notified Staff he will not be in attendance.
- OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION
 - ✓ 2013 Hearing Dates Memo
 - ✓ Correspondence for Item 6
 - ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation
- GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

None

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- The 2013 Hearing Date Memo has been prepared and is available on the back table and in Boardmember blue folders. The only change is to the final meeting of the year, which will be held on Friday, December 6, 2013 rather than Thursday, 12/5.
- The next DAS meeting will be held on Wednesday, December 5, 2012. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, December 10, 2012. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be on Monday, February 11, 2013.
- Boardmembers will note today's agenda includes: 1 referral from Development Services and 10 individual homeowner nominations. There are 7 homeowner nominations in 2012 that have not been reviewed by staff and brought forward for designation.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 6 has requested the nomination be withdrawn until further notice.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 3 of 9

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 5 – JOHN AND JOAN VONDRACEK HOUSE

ITEM 7 – JOHN HENRY AND KATHERINE ZITT HOUSE

ITEM 8 - J. REX AND ALICE MURRAY SPEC. HOUSE #1

ITEM 9 - JOSEPH KELLY SPEC HOUSE #1

ITEM 10 – W. W. AND HAZEL HUMMON HOUSE

ITEM 11 – JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #3

ITEM 12 – KELLY FAMILY HOUSE

ITEM 13 – DR. ANITA FIGUEREDO BUILDINGS

Boardmember Berge pulled Items 5 and 10 from the consent agenda

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEMS 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 9-0-0 Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – CALTRANS: OVERVIEW OF IMPROVEMENTS TO CABRILLO BRIDGE & SR 163 HISTORIC DIST

Representatives from CalTrans will provide an overview of various improvements and rehabilitation projects planned for the Cabrillo Bridge and SR 163.

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge likes the accent lights.

Chair Lemmo also likes the accent lights.

Boardmember Larimer likes the accent lighting, questioned what if the outside and inside were lit.

Vice-Chair Garbini wanted to know if DAS will have an opportunity to review the landscape plan.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – JOHN AND JOAN VONDRACEK HOUSE

Applicant: Micah & Elisabeth Parzen, represented by Scott Moomjian

Location: 851 Amiford Drive, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 2-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 851 Amiford Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 4 of 9

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the John and Joan Vondracek House located at 851 Amiford Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1959 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 256 square foot rear bedroom addition constructed in 1965.

Report Number: HRB-12-069 Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge does not think it clearly embodies the distinctive characteristics of the International style. When you look at Contemporary style, this house meets the majority of the features. It fails in three ways: timeframe, materials, and composition for International style.

Boardmember Rivera does not support designation, she is concerned that we do not have a history of the architect and if this design was his intent. West wall texture is the biggest concern.

Boardmember Larimer fully supports designation, doesn't take note of International style; regular stack bonding of concrete blocks emblematic of the style.

Boardmember Marrone supports Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini supports designation as International style with influences. The black pine tree is very important to the style of architecture, as well as the Juniper.

Chair Lemmo supports Staff's recommendation and agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini's comments that these are rare and unique resources.

Boardmember Baksh supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods supports Staff's recommendation. It is a very stylish example of International architecture. It was constructed late in the period, but that is OK.

Boardmember Curry supports Staff's recommendation; you can't cut off style by definitively by year.

Boardmember Berge mentioned that International style resources are rare, and she does not support designation.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – JOHN AND JOAN VONDRACEK HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini Vote: 8-2-0 Motion Passes

(Berge, Rivera)

ITEM 6 – CANADA DRY BOTTLING/STROMBERG-CARLSON BUILDING

Applicant: Jonathan Segal represented by Marie Burke Lia

Owner: Maidhof Bros LTD

<u>Location</u>: 1895 Hancock Street, 92110, Midway-Pacific Highway Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-G**) <u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1895 Hancock Street as a historical resource. Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 5 of 9

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Canada Dry Bottling/Stromberg-Carlson Building located at 1895 Hancock Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1947 and 1955-63 under HRB Criteria A and C. The Criterion A designation applies to the original 1947 building and the 1958 and 1959 additions; while the Criterion C designation applies only to the original 1947 building.

Report Number: HRB-12-065

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 7 – JOHN HENRY AND KATHERINE ZITT HOUSE

Applicant: Lehman-Felkner Revocable Trust represented by Jaye MacAskill

Location: 2961 1st Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1269 7-A**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2961 1st Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the John Henry and Katherine Zitt House located at 2961 1st Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of c.1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 300 square-foot single-story addition on the south elevation constructed ca.1940s-50s as well as the rear addition along the eastern elevation with an attached 2-story garage and casita unit constructed ca. 2009 (1,200 square feet total).

Report Number: HRB-12-071

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – J. REX AND ALICE MURRAY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Aaron and Victoria Haberman represented by Scott A. Moomijan

<u>Location</u>: 4266 Arista Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4266 Arista Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the J. Rex and Alice Murray Spec. House #1 located at 4266 Arista Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB-12-072

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – JOSEPH KELLY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: James Grisdale and Joyceline Coupal represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2672 Poinsettia Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 6-C)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2672 Poinsettia Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Joseph Kelly Spec House #1 located at 2672 Poinsettia Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes 440 square foot detached garage constructed in 1992.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 6 of 9

Report Number: HRB-12-073
ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 - W. W. AND HAZEL HUMMON HOUSE

Applicant: Richard Park and Jennie Best represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1031 Alexandria Drive, 92107, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 2-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1031 Alexandria Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the W. W. and Hazel Hummon House located at 1031 Alexandria Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the second floor enclosed balcony above the garage totaling about 279 square feet.

<u>Report Number</u>: HRB-12-074 Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Curry likes the house and agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Woods agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Baksh agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Silvas agrees with Staff's recommendation, good history in the report.

Vice-Chair Garbini agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Rivera agrees with Staff's recommendation, surprised it was not on consent.

Boardmember Berge does not support designation under Criterion C. Arial photo appears to show garage wrapping around, and believes there are more changes than enclosure. Usually a house has only one focal window, but this house has an ornate window at the side too, which compete with the garage and other window. She could support designation under Criterion A.

Boardmember Rivera asked if the stained glass window was original.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MARRONE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – W. W. AND HAZEL HUMMON HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Rivera

Vote: 9-1-0 Motion Passes

(Berge)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 7 of 9

ITEM 11 – THE JOHN SNYDER/RALPH E. HURLBURT AND CHARLES H. TIFAL SPEC HOUSE #3

Applicant: Shea Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

<u>Location</u>: 4386 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-D**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4386 Trias Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the John Snyder/Ralph E. Hurlburt and Charles H. Tifal Spec House #3 as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear one story addition.

Report Number: HRB-12-075

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 12 – KELLY FAMILY HOUSE

Applicant: Anthony Keller and Sherri Rudinsky represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 1538 Granada Avenue, 92102, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 2-E**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1538 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Kelly Family House located at 1538 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 470 square foot detached garage as it has been significantly altered since the 1912 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB-12-076

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – DR. ANITA FIGUEREDO BUILDINGS

Applicant: Casa Sana LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 417 Coast Blvd and 418-20 Coast Blvd South, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1227 7-E**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 417 Coast Blvd and 418-20 Coast Blvd South as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Dr. Anita Figueredo Buildings located at 417 Coast Boulevard and 418 & 420 Coast Boulevard South as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956-1982 and 1925-1931 under HRB Criteria B and C respectively.

Report Number: HRB-12-077

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 -560 SAN GORGONIO STREET

Applicant: Robert Ellis represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 560 San Gorgonio Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 560 San Gorgonio Street as a historical resource.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 8 of 9

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 560 San Gorgonio Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB-12-078

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Marie Burke Lia, Scott Moomjian

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Berge asked if the deck is excluded, can it be addressed as part of the Mills Act. She fully supports Staff's recommendation; the deck should be restored back to the 1973 appearance.

Boardmember Rivera supports Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Larimer only has issue with the deck. An open rail not allowed by current code. It is a beautiful home.

Boardmember Marrone thinks that house is fabulous, with dramatic roof and eaves. The deck isn't part of the structure of the house, and could be removed/restored.

Vice-Chair Garbini asked if the façade on garage and entry original. She is in support of designation under Criterion D, because there is so much that is original. Deck is minor.

Chair Lemmo agrees with Vice-Chair Garbini.

Boardmember Silvas likes the house.

Boardmember Baksh likes the house, but is bothered by the deck.

Boardmember Woods thinks it is a beautiful house, but deck is such a character defining feature.

Boardmember Curry thinks the house has a lot of characteristics of the style, and can support designation under Criterion D

Boardmember Rivera agrees it is a fabulous home and could potentially support Criterion D with the deck excluded.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER CURRY TO DESIGNATE ITEM 14 – EDWARD AND ALDENA SILVA/SIM BRUCE RICHARDS HOUSE AS A REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT SIM BRUCE RICHARDS UNDER CRITERION D WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FROM 1953-1973.

After the motion was made by Boardmember Curry; Marie Burke Lia, representing the applicant, asked for a continuance based on Municipal Code Section 123.0202(d). The Board granted the continuance.

ITEM 15 – 4364 WITHERBY STREET

<u>Applicant</u>: Schmieg-Watters Family Trust represented by Johnson and Johnson Architecture <u>Location</u>: 4364 Witherby Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (**1268 5-G**)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of November 29, 2012 Page 9 of 9

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4364 Witherby Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 4364 Witherby Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB-12-079 Staff Report by Sarah Vonesh

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson (*Kirsten Schmieg-Watters*)

Board Discussion:

Boardmember Woods thinks the windows are OK, but is bothered by the stucco.

Boardmember Baksh agrees

Boardmember Silvas agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Vice-Chair Garbini agrees with Staff's recommendation, house is beautiful.

Boardmember Marrone agrees with Staff's recommendation, quite a transformation from the 2005 stucco.

Boardmember Larimer agrees with Staff's recommendation, the stucco is prominent.

Boardmember Rivera agrees with Staff's recommendation.

Boardmember Berge wanted to send report back to consultant to look at the period of architecture rather than the style. She is not prepared to designate today.

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, January 24, 2012

LOCATION: City Administration Building

12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:19PM